

ABSTRACTS

I. PAPERS FROM THE CONFERENCE “8 SEPTEMBER 1713: THE SHOCK OF THE *UNIGENITUS BULL*”

1. The papal bull in the Jansenist debates on translation and on grace

Sylvio Hermann DE FRANCESCHI

Theologians’ practice faced with the challenge of the quarrel on grace: the issue of the forms of theological discourse in France at the time of the Unigenitus bull.

The quarrel on grace, at the time of the publication of the *Unigenitus* bull, forms a vantage point from which to attempt to grasp the transformations that affect theological practices in France at the end of the classical age. Since its beginnings over a century and a half earlier, this Catholic quarrel on grace had constantly oscillated between a rigorously speculative discourse and works that accorded more and more attention to positive theology. At the meeting of Molinist, Augustian and Thomistic movements, the quarrel was behind changes in the form and method of theological discourse.

Keywords: Theology; Divine grace

Simon ICARD

Did the Unigenitus bull condemn Saint Augustine? The case of the thirteenth proposition

When studying Jansenism, one cannot go without studying interpretations of Saint Augustine in the early modern period. The thirteenth proposition, which is condemned in the *Unigenitus* bull, is particularly interesting. On the one hand, it is supposed to be a quotation from a book by Saint Augustine, *De Correptione et gratia*, and, on the other hand, it focuses on the delicate question of resistance to divine grace. What this analysis highlights

is the fact that early modern theologians use their own means of interpretation in the passages where Saint Augustine refutes the idea that human will can stand in the way of the will of God.

Keywords: Saint Augustine; Divine grace

Els AGTEN

Pasquier Quesnel and the translation of the Bible into the vernacular in Holland. The situation before and after the shock of Unigenitus

The present article studies the links between Pasquier Quesnel and the translations of the “Jansenist” Bible in Holland in the context of the *Unigenitus* bull. Quesnel was known to be a partisan of translating of the Bible into the vernacular, and propositions 79-85 of *Unigenitus* deal with this subject. During his exile in the Low Countries, first in Brussels (1685-1705), and then in Amsterdam (1705-1719), Quesnel kept an occasionally intense correspondence with three translators, namely Égide de Witte, André van der Schuur and Philippe Louis Verhulst. The letters deal not only with Bible translation, but also with papal bulls against Jansenism and the literary output of the translators.

Keywords: Bible translation; Church of Holland

2. Theological-political aspects of the papal bull

Dick SCHOON

Unigenitus in Holland: the episcopal clergy between obedience and independence

The *Unigenitus* bull had important consequences for the Catholic Church in the United Provinces. The church fitted into a political and religious context that affected the reception of the bull. A separation from Rome

followed, and the “Clérésie” – which would later become the Old Catholic Church – wavered constantly between obedience and independence. It was not until 1966 that relations became peaceful, but differences of opinion persist, particularly in the ecclesiological field.

Keywords: Ecclesiology; Holland Church

Michèle BRETZ

“The Constitution is where all of the Church’s ills lead”: Abbé d’Étemare’s ecclesiology.

Abbé d’Étemare, a key player in the struggle against the *Unigenitus* bull, launched his work, *Remarques en forme de dissertations sur les Propositions condamnées par la bulle Unigenitus*, into the public domain in 1723. It offers an interesting account of the Jansenist struggle that undermined the pope’s authority; it is also a reflection of the division wearing down the clergy. The Abbé’s rebellion was based on his ecclesiology of Augustinian inspiration. He makes a distinction between the visible Church and the invisible Church; Port-Royal belongs to the invisible Church. The Abbé claims the heritage of Port-Royal, because the papal bull comes after the Formulary. The controversial work aims to conquer public opinion, which, over time, joins the Parliament’s cause.

Keywords: Ecclesiology; Abbé d’Étemare

Olivier ANDURAND

The pastoral instruction of the XL: a Gallican translation of the Unigenitus bull?

In order to be received in France, *Unigenitus* had to undergo adjustments and negotiations. This is the purpose of the extraordinary assembly of the clergy of France convened by the king as soon as the bull was received. The pastoral instruction which results from this allows the ultramontanist rough

patches to be smoothed out, and thus makes Roman wishes acceptable to an episcopacy that was still very much Gallican. However, this text, which has a dogmatic impact, shows that the bishops of France did not give up on playing an active role in the definition of dogma. While marking the disappearance of royal Gallicanism, the *Unigenitus* quarrel highlights the intensity of episcopal Gallicanism in the first half of the eighteenth century.

Keywords: Gallicanism; Church of France

Henri DURANTON

Theology by auction: satirical poetry in the service of the good fight

The rejection of the papal bull by the Jansenist party did not only take the form of learned theological rebuttals. Anonymous poets also used versified satire to fight *Unigenitus* and its followers, bishops who recognised the bull, and especially Jesuits. All genres were called upon for this relentless combat: fables, tales, popular poetry, songs, a shower of epigrams, and many others. These countless poems have remained unknown to date, even for the best Jansenist historians. They are, however, the reflection of a deliberate strategy by the Party, which wanted, through this carnival inspiration, to convert a popular audience to its cause. It succeeded perfectly, imposing on public opinion a baleful image of the Jesuit, a prelude to the suppression of the Society of Jesus in the 1760s.

Keywords: Satire; Anti-Jesuit

Stéphanie RAMBAUD

The Sarcelades: an investigation into the Jansenist lampoonist collection at the Mazarine library

The *Sarcelades* refer to a collection of items of satirical verse, in what is known as Parisian dialect, written and published from 1731 to 1754 in the name of Sarcelles residents. Through the voice of one of their own, they complain about the behaviour of the archbishops of Paris, Bishop de

Vintimille, then Bishop de Beaumont, by addressing them informally. These satirical tracts, of which almost all of the editions have been preserved at the Mazarine library, also criticize the catechism of the archbishop of Sens, Bishop Languet de Gergy. All of the *Sarcelades* keep the bull *Unigenitus* as a backdrop. The *Harangues* are the work of Nicolas Jouin, who emerged from anonymity when this work was published.

Keywords: Sarcelades; Nicolas Jouin

3. The reception of the papal bull and the political forces present

Jean-Philippe LLORED

Cardinal de Noailles and ecclesiology

Louis-Antoine de Noailles, a brilliant prelate promoted to the archbishopric of Paris in 1695, experienced the worst affronts as soon as he was appointed. He was rebuked for his endorsement of Pasquier Quesnel's *Réflexions* while he was still bishop of Châlons. Concerned about preserving Clement IX's Peace, he threw himself into vast undertakings of theological exegesis. As a cardinal and a participant at the conclave that elected Clement XI, he traps himself in his palinodes during the affair of the *Cas de conscience* in 1703. His prestige and credibility are harmed, and he sees the French clergy split as they are obliged to take a stance on Quesnel's doctrine: the exiled theologian was arrested in 1705. Noailles was the target of slander on the part of Père Le Tellier and certain Jesuits, and his strong, overly delayed reactions wind up provoking the ire of the king and Madame de Maintenon. The affair of the three bishops against Noailles results in the drafting of the *Unigenitus* bull fulminated on 8 September 1713.

Keywords: Cardinal de Noailles; Duc de Saint-Simon

Claude MULLER

Orthodoxy and heterodoxy: Gaston de Rohan, spearhead against the Jansenists?

Gaston de Rohan played an essential role after the publication of the *Unigenitus* bull in 1713. Although he had displayed an outward appearance of Gallicanism at the start of the Bishops' meeting that he led in 1713, he affirmed being an ultramontanist very clearly from 1714. One can naturally wonder: is it his diocese, Alsace, totally uninvolved with Jansenism, which contributed towards shaping the convictions of the Prince-Bishop of Strasbourg? Or did he find himself naturally aligned with his clergy? And do these convictions betray a political submission?

Keywords: Gaston de Rohan; Church of France

Louis de CARBONNIÈRES

The public prosecutor and the Unigenitus bull: the example of Pierre Gilbert de Voisins, assistant public prosecutor at the Parliament of Paris (1718-1738)

Pierre Gilbert de Voisins was a lawyer at the Parliament of Paris from 1718 to 1740. He spoke for the king at most of the trials taken against the writings adversely affecting royal authority in enforcing the bull *Unigenitus*. Calling against Jansenist works or overtly in favour of the papal bull, Gilbert de Voisins came in for criticism from all parties, still without receiving an unconditional support from ministers or the Lord Chancellor. Nevertheless, he never abandons a simple course of action: respect for law and order, the authority of legal principles. His great fear is that of a schism, and he advocates conciliation. His closing speeches for the prosecution, which are always measured, bring him numerous criticisms and even satirical songs. His moderate and reasoned criminal policy causes him to be considered at once an unconditional henchman of the papal bull and an uncompromising Jansenist. He was simply a magistrate who was aware of his duties towards the king and religion.

Keywords: Parliament of Paris; Gilbert de Voisins.

Philippe MOULIS

The influence of the Unigenitus bull in the north of France from 1713 to 1730

The use of unpublished manuscript sources allow a new perspective of the history of the reception of the *Unigenitus* bull in the north of France. A huge network of “appellant” priests was built up around Pierre de Langle. The stakes of the struggle were in particular the control of ecclesiastical training, education and advantages. Opposite this faction, the anti-Jansenists also developed networks, and the confrontations were sometimes violent. The reactions of the people allowed clarification in understanding this area, the border of catholicity in the far reaches of France and the Low Countries.

Keywords: Pierre de Langle; northern France.

4. The papal bull outside of France

Albane PIALOUX

The “big issue”: Unigenitus in relations between France and Rome, from Benedict XIII to Benedict XIV.

From the fulmination of the papal bull at the end of Benedict XIV’s pontificate, the constitution *Unigenitus* weighed upon relations between France and Rome. This “big issue” constituted the framework of the ban on “French maxims” with regard to Rome. The 1730s were marked at the same time by political-religious crises and by the soothing silence desired by the Cardinal de Fleury to put an end to the shock waves. Finally, thanks to the political intelligence of the main players who knew how to learn from this experience, the preparation of the encyclical *Ex omnibus*, written by Benedict XIV at the request of Louis XV, allowed a new blow to be avoided.

Keywords: Holy See; Diplomacy

Michel VAN MEERBEECK

Acta Ecclesiae Mechliniensis

Through certain publications, the future Cardinal d'Alsace had earned the goodwill of the Roman authorities. He established a pastoral letter and asked his recipients to subscribe to it. Just as he had attempted to demonstrate the unanimity of the universal Church around the papal bull, he would demonstrate through the *Acta ecclesiae mechliniensis* this unanimity at the level of his diocese and his ecclesiastical province. He had his collection published in 1718 and, even before receiving all of the replies, sent it to Rome. It was a huge success, despite signatures from outside of his diocese. Thomas-Philippe's exploit was not in vain: twelve months after his pastoral letter and his adherence to the *Pastoralis officii* letters, he was promoted to cardinal.

Keywords: Austrian Netherlands; Cardinal d'Alsace

Leonhard HELL

Inclementia Clementis: some Lutheran reactions to the Unigenitus bull

The Lutheran reception of the Unigenitus constitutions is not well known. Yet the papal bull aroused a certain interest. The analysis of texts by theologians such as Christoph Matthäus Pfaff, Christian Eberhard Weisman and others allow us to shed new light on these issues. We can open a certain number of research leads like the theme of grace, the access to the Scriptures or the question of the ecclesiastical magisterium. What appears is the image of a world that is much less withdrawn and compartmentalised that we might assume.

Keywords: Lutheranism; Germanic world

Emmanuel LACAM

“Rome is no longer in Rome”: the Mediterranean activism of a Jansenist reformer for the promulgation of a counter-Unigenitus: Abbé Jean-Charles Augustin Clément (1754-1771)

Through his network of correspondence, and his travels in the Mediterranean space between Rome and Madrid between 1754 and 1771, Abbé Clément deployed a lobbying strategy in favour of the promulgation by the Holy See of a body of Augustinian doctrine, which would annul previous condemnations, most notably the *Unigenitus* bull. As a constant objective of the Parisian specialists in canon law from Boursier to Gourlin, including the lawyer Le Paige, the publication of this new pontifical bull experienced three successive failures in 1725, 1758 and 1771. It is the sign of an irreversible discrepancy between the spiritual and dogmatic world of European Jansenists and the ecclesiological orientation of the papacy, which perceived clearly, behind the ban by the Augustinians on reading of their African Father, the calling into question of the uncompromising Roman culture.

Keywords: Abbé Clément; Regalism

5. Readings of *Unigenitus*

Daniel-Odon HUREL

The time has come to break the silence and leave the cloister: the Maurist priors and the appeal to the general council

The Benedictines of Saint Maur probably formed the most significant set of “appellants” among the regular clergy of medieval heritage. Beyond the simple quantitative and geographical analysis of the appeal to Saint Maur, the collection published by Jean-Baptiste Nivelles allows, on the one hand to better understand the networks of diffusion of the appeal of the *Unigenitus* bull, and on the other hand to analyse the actual texts of the community appeals, which were drafted during the conventual chapter. The Maurists decide either to draw up short texts or to send long texts in which the speeches of the priors and the

conditions in which the appeal was discussed and drafted can be read. The arguments in favour of the appeal are not necessarily original, but they are testament to the theological and political background in which the Maurists were trained and in which they evolved, as they base their decision on the fact that they are the custodians of an entire tradition and that it is their duty to defend the Church.

Keywords: Benedictines of Saint Maur; Appeal to the council

Christine GOUZI

The Unigenitus bull viewed through the engraving in the eighteenth century: between contestation and explanation

The *Unigenitus* bull appears as the matrix of a very rich thematic, which relates as much to the religious as to the political in the course of the eighteenth century. In this mass of images, of which the papal bull seems to be the principal justification, there are several which illustrate this in a more significant way and, especially, which respond to didactical and controversial wishes directed precisely against the content of the bull and even against its existence.

Keywords: Engravings; Controversy

Jean-Pierre CHANTIN

100 years on: Unigenitus in the controversies on the subject of Jansenism (1802-1830)

In the Church of France reorganised after the Concordat of 1801 agreed between Napoleon and Pius VII, the issue of submission to the *Unigenitus* bull, a century after its publication, remained a central question. The calling into question of a decision by the papacy was considered to be an act of schism by certain bishops, while among the “Friends of Truth,” the fight for the appeal remained a major commitment.

Keywords: Church of France; Concordat of 1801

II. ADDITIONS TO THE CONFERENCE

Lenore ROUSE

The Miscellanea Relativa Alla Bolla Unigenitus and related documents at the Albani library

The largest part of the Albani library, originating from the family's palace in the town of Urbino, was acquired by the Catholic University of America in 1928. Known as the Clementine library, this collection has received little attention from European researchers, because of the absence of cataloguing. This study examines some recently inventoried 800 titles in the *Miscellanea Relativa alla Bolla Unigenitus* series, essentially paper pamphlets in French, which provide documentation on the responses made to the papal bull. A certain number of these titles, collected over decades by the Albani family, cannot be found elsewhere in the United States. The physical characteristics of the works, intersected with the information coming from early catalogues, shed new light on the eventful history of the Albani collection.

Keywords: Albani library; Clement XI

Stéphanie RAMBAUD

1713: the Unigenitus affair

On the occasion of the tercentenary of the papal bull *Unigenitus*, an exhibition was organised by the Mazarine library, with the collaboration of the Port-Royal library. The exhibition was based on the vast Jansenist collections at the Mazarine Library, and revolved around three chapters: the facts (from the year 1713 to the sudden new development of the Appeal in 1717); opinion (illustrating the divisions within French society); memory (cultivated by Jansenist supporters until the late nineteenth century). The exhibition catalogue is given here, with an illustration booklet excluding text.

Keywords: Mazarine library; Port-Royal library

III. VARIA

Jean LESAULNIER

The major “works” on Port-Royal des Champs in the years 1651-1653

Under the aegis of Mère Angélique Arnauld, abbess of the two Port-Royal houses, a series of major “works” were implemented over three years around the monastery at Port-Royal des Champs. The external appearance of the ancient abbey and the conventual life of the nuns were thoroughly altered. Beyond the buildings, the immediate surroundings near Vaumurier and the farm at the Granges were also concerned by this ambitious project.

Keywords: Port-Royal des Champs; Château de Vaumurier

Valérie GUITTIENNE-MÜRGER

The death of Abbé Grégoire: the final battle

Six years before his illness and death, Abbé Grégoire suspected that his funeral would be the reason for a crisis with the ultramontane clergy. The events surrounding his death and funeral were to show how right he was. After the enthusiasm that followed the July Revolution, the year 1831 was marked by much agitation. It was in this context that Grégoire fell ill. The Parisian clergy, nostalgic for Charles X, saw this as the opportunity to refuse the last rites to the old revolutionary, but this attempt came to a sudden end following government pressure. As for Grégoire’s funeral, it turned into a political protest.

Keywords: Abbé Grégoire; July Monarchy